



MEETING

The regular meeting of the Hayward Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. by Chairperson Caveglia, followed by the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL

Present:	COMMISSIONERS	Bogue, Halliday, Sacks, Thnay, Williams, Zermeño
	CHAIRPERSON	Caveglia
Absent:	COMMISSIONER	None

Staff Members Present: Anderly, Collins, Conneely, Garcia, Looney, Patenaude

General Public Present: Approximately 12

PUBLIC COMMENT

Chairperson Caveglia apologized for missing the last two meetings.

AGENDA

1. **Use Permit/Site Plan Review Application No. 00-160-05 - Al Shaghahi for SLS Associates, Inc. (Applicant) / Sellau Properties, Inc. & Wirrulla Hayward, LLC (Owners):** Request for a Retail Center to Accommodate a 126,000-Square-Foot Regional Retail Building (Target) with a 7,886-Square-Foot Garden Center, and a Pad for a Future 8,000-Square-Foot Restaurant/Retail Building, on Approximately 13 Acres - *The Project is Located at the Northeast Corner of Whipple Road and Industrial Parkway Southwest.*

PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. **Use Permit/Site Plan Review Application No. 00-160-05 - Al Shaghahi for SLS Associates, Inc. (Applicant) / Sellau Properties, Inc. & Wirrulla Hayward, LLC (Owners):** Request for a Retail Center to Accommodate a 126,000-Square-Foot Regional Retail Building (Target) with a 7,886-Square-Foot Garden Center, and a Pad for a Future 8,000-Square-Foot Restaurant/Retail Building, on Approximately 13 Acres - *The Project is Located at the Northeast Corner of Whipple Road and Industrial Parkway Southwest.*

Acting Principal Planner Patenaude described the projected Target store on the site with an additional restaurant/retail pad. One condition of approval is an entry monument at the entrance to the site, which will create a statement on entering the City of Hayward. The traffic study indicates removal of street parking on the southerly side of Whipple to accommodate street

improvements. He noted that the proposal is consistent with the City's goals and policies for development on this site, which also provides an anchor at Hayward's southern gateway. Staff recommended Planning Commission adopt the Mitigated Negative Declaration, and approve the Use Permit/Site Plan Review Application subject to findings and conditions of approval.

Commissioner Williams asked about the condition requiring the minimum standards for the City Parking Ordinance rather than the maximum. He hoped the parking would be adequate.

Acting Principal Planner Patenaude responded that the number of parking stalls proposed exceeds the City minimum. He explained that the Condition of Approval relative to parking relates to adequate stall size and parking aisles.

Commissioner Sacks asked about Condition 22 g., regarding the decorative fence.

Acting Principal Planner Patenaude explained that the area on the south side of the project will be set aside for required wetlands and that the Army Corps permit may require a specific type of fencing. The type of fence prepared will allow is to provide access to the building by the Fire Department.

Commissioner Sacks discussed the Negative Declaration Item #6 indicating that the loss of wetlands should be replaced by a ratio of 2:1, not 1:1 as indicated. Acting Principal Planner Patenaude indicated that the Negative Declaration would be corrected to match the requirement for 2:1 replacement as stated in the staff report. She then asked about public transportation to the site.

Acting Principal Planner Patenaude responded that AC Transit has a new route through this area. He did not know whether it would serve the site.

Commissioner Zermeño commented on the nice drawings and whether the Commission would see drawings of the entry monument before it goes up.

Acting Principal Planner Patenaude explained that the concept had not been developed yet. The intent is that there could be an administrative approval. He further described the drawings explaining that the easterly side is a truck area with loading docks. There may be a walkway along the wetlands.

Commissioner Thnay said he thought it was a complex job and good report. He asked questions about the Conditions regarding Engineering/Transportation. He asked about the Industrial Parkway South West intersection and how projected traffic will be accommodated. The two left turn and two existing lanes are part of the Conditions. He noted that bike racks would be a good condition to enhance the project. He stated that the traffic study assumed a signal at Wiegman and Whipple, and asked whether it would be installed.

Transportation/Development Manager Collins responded that the City has gotten a federal grant for the signal and will be going ahead with it.

**REGULAR MEETING OF THE PLANNING
COMMISSION, CITY OF HAYWARD, Council
Chambers****Thursday, April 12, 2001, 7:30 P.M.
777 "B" Street, Hayward, CA 94541**

Commissioner Thnay then asked about the drive-ways into the gas station at the southeast corner of Industrial Parkway and Whipple Road. This project is adding substantial traffic. He noted that a left turn, in and out, and a double left turn lane might create unsafe and confusing traffic. He suggested that the landscaping in the General Plan describes a theme for this area and instead of a double lane, perhaps a landscape median could be installed with 11-foot lanes and enhance the project with the landscaping for this area since this is a huge project for the City of Hayward.

Transportation/Development Manager Collins commented that the 2-way left turn lane leads easterly into a left-turn only lane. If a problem occurs, a median island might help. If there is still a problem, a physical barrier might be needed. Unfortunately, there is heavy truck traffic along this section and the State requires 12-foot lanes (part of the intersection is controlled by CalTrans). He also noted that this is leading toward an on-ramp to the freeway.

Commissioner Thnay commented that the City of Hayward could apply to the State for special allowance for 11-foot lanes. He noted that the City is missing an opportunity for a landscape area, which also provides a shield for pedestrian traffic. It provides a roadway for all kinds of travel, including pedestrian and bicycle traffic. He suggested a second look at providing good treatment for the project. He commented on the Union Landing layout across the freeway with landscape medians.

Acting Principal Planner Patenaude responded that they were not looking at this as having significant pedestrian traffic since there are no near-by residences. Staff will encourage increased landscaping along the street.

Commissioner Halliday asked about the history of the Sam's Club project and whether the City Council would look more favorably on this project than the Sam's Club.

Acting Principal Planner Patenaude responded that Sam's Club only came to Council because of an appeal over the denial of the gas station and the undergrounding of utilities. He added that they described other uses they would like to see on this property including a hotel. The developer's representatives responded that they had looked at alternatives but found no hotel interested. The CCCCIC, the City Council Commercial Center Improvement Committee, agreed that overall the architecture of this project is good but asked that they break up the roof lines.

Chairperson Caveglia asked about the wetlands and whether there is there any expectation of adding more. He also asked whether dirt would be hauled in to fill in this project. He then asked for more detail on the fencing and gateway proposals.

Acting Principal Planner Patenaude explained that the developer might answer some of these

questions more fully.

The public hearing opened at 8:11 p.m.

David Gilmore, Gray Ventures spokesman, commended the City staff for their professionalism and responsiveness. He noted that following the Sam's Club disapproval, they went back to the drawing board. He noted that Target is already a subsidiary of a long-standing Hayward business via Mervyn's Corporate office. They eliminated the gas station and scaled down the pad area by 20,000 sq. feet. This project will include more landscaping and parking than the Sam's Club project. He noted that they listened to what the Committee concerns were. They redesigned the building and added to the density and quality of planting for the project. They were willing to put in bike racks. He noted that he is already buying the property from a hotel developer who was not able to secure a hotelier for this site. The wetlands and layout of the land make it difficult for a hotel user to put up a successful configuration. He added that Target is happy with the conditions as proposed.

Brian Sowers, traffic engineer on the project, worked closely with City staff. The largest issues were the left and right turn exiting lanes.

Mr. Gilmore added that the proposal for the fence around the wetlands would include columns and a heavy chain to allow for Fire Department access.

Chairperson Caveglia asked about the number and length of truck trips for fill on the project.

Al Shaghghi, representing the applicant, said it would take an average of two weeks to complete the fill which is necessary since the elevation on some of the site is below the water table.

Commissioner Bogue discussed the fence and whether it would be adequate to prevent people from walking through the wetlands.

Mr. Gilmore commented that it is possible that people could scale the fence but the fencing is a compromise with Fire Department for their access to the building in case of an emergency.

The landscape architect for the project described dense shrubs for screening along Whipple, at least 3 or 4 feet high, as well as the 10' high box trees supplied in the parking area.

Commissioner Williams asked that the project not look like a used car lot with the huge size of the parking around the building.

The landscape architect agreed that the 24" box trees, evergreens, and ground cover at least 20-ft wide along with dense rows of shrubs 4' high should visually screen many of the cars on the lot. He noted there will be a lot of color, accent and solid screening at the driver's level.

Commissioner Halliday commented on the need for pedestrian orientation in the parking lot. Perhaps they could create walkways from the parking lot to the store.



Mr. Gilmore indicated that the actual appearance of the project would be like looking at a landscape berm. Responding to a question from Commissioner Halliday, he indicated that the grassy swales are per the direction of the Regional Quality Board and that there is no location for a pedestrian walkway.

Commissioner Zermeño recommended including bike racks. The applicant indicated that this was acceptable to him.

Commissioner Thnay said he liked the project. It will enable residents to spend money in Hayward. He added that he liked the trees and the shrubs. He asked again about the double left-turn lanes, and the projected traffic. He suggested putting in a landscape median.

Chairperson Caveglia asked for further information about the restaurant pad projected for the property.

Mr. Gilmore responded that they are working to find a tenant at this point, which will be a substantial sit-down type restaurant.

Commissioner Sacks asked that until the restaurant is built that the applicant maintain the area so it will look nice and not just be a weed patch. She was assured this will be done.

Tom Allman, Service station owner in the area, said he liked the project. He noted that they had AC Transit Bus service at his station. He commented that if a median is installed, he would lose a substantial portion of his business.

The public hearing closed at 8:34 p.m.

Commissioner Zermeño moved, seconded by Commissioner Williams, to approve the Use Permit/Site Plan Review Application subject to the findings and conditions of approval, and to adopt the Mitigated Negative Declaration.

Commissioner Sacks asked that the 2:1 mitigation for wetlands be included. She was told it was not necessary since it is already included in the staff report. She recalled when the Commission worked on this before, the Commission specifically assured businesses owners along Whipple Road that they would not lose customer access. She commented that any landscape median would not work with this commitment. She said she would support the motion.

Commissioner Thnay agreed that access to businesses is the basic thing to do. He suggested that staff look carefully at this location and investigate any automobile accidents and their cause. He

expressed concern regarding left turns made at this location.

Commissioner Halliday said she, too, would support motion but asked for staff and the applicant to give additional consideration to more details including sidewalks and making it pedestrian friendly. She commented that there should be more concern regarding access from parking lots. They should look more at safe passage for pedestrians through the cars in a parking lot.

Commissioner Bogue agreed to support the motion. He noted that the design of the Target store in this proposal has a lot more detail than the Sam's Club proposal and is a great improvement. As to the median, it would be impossible to allow left-turn access to businesses on the south side of Whipple Road.

Chairperson Caveglia commented that the building is fine but the parking lot is huge. He suggested that staff look at alternative designs to the concept of siting a building in the middle of such a great amount of asphalt.

The motion passed unanimously.

ADDITIONAL MATTERS

3. Oral Report on Planning and Zoning Matters

Planning Manager Anderly announced that the Planning Commission would be meeting on the first two Saturdays in June. The first Saturday in June will involve a tour of the Pittsburgh Calpine plant; the next Saturday is for a public workshop on the General Plan revision. She noted there will also be four Planning Commission meetings in June.

4. Commissioners' Announcements, Referrals

Commissioner Zermeño commented on the sea of asphalt for this most recent project and asked that staff look at a way to bring the buildings to the forefront or possibly add roof parking rather than surrounding the building with such enormous parking lots.

Commissioner Thnay reported on an article he read about a gentleman taking walking tour of the country and encouraged walk ways for pedestrians. He also suggested more bike access to transit stations in the area.

Commissioner Williams suggested more traffic control at peak hours along Hayward Boulevard during this recent construction. He said it creates an unsafe condition for driver's who cannot see oncoming traffic. He also suggested keeping the dust down.

Commissioner Sacks commented on her recent vacation to Costa Rica and the number of parks and vegetation in the area. She said she was impressed that they had so few concrete walls in the area.

MINUTES



**REGULAR MEETING OF THE PLANNING
COMMISSION, CITY OF HAYWARD, Council
Chambers**

**Thursday, April 12, 2001, 7:30 P.M.
777 "B" Street, Hayward, CA 94541**

Commissioner Halliday asked about the trellis at the Schaffer Park Shopping Center and whether it was finished and had been approved by the City. She also thanked Commissioner Thnay for his comments and concerns regarding more greenery in the City, and asked for further consideration of pedestrian access through huge parking lots.

Commissioners Halliday and Williams both indicated they would not be available for the April 26 meeting.

MINUTES

- March 22, 2001. The minutes were held over at the request of Ron Barklow and Commissioner Halliday for inclusion of a comment by Mr. Wiemkin that there would be no problem with birds at the project since the trees were removed.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned by Chairperson Caveglia at 8:58 p.m.

APPROVED:

Ed Bogue, Secretary
Planning Commission

ATTEST:

Edith Looney
Commission Secretary

DRAFT