



---

May 21, 2014

**TO:** Waste Management Authority (WMA) Board  
**FROM:** Gary Wolff, Executive Director  
**SUBJECT:** Draft Resolution on Recycling Worker Pay and Health Benefits

**BACKGROUND:**

Recycling workers in our county are paid and benefited at various levels, and in some cases receive little more than minimum wages. Some of these workers, but not all, are members of the International Longshore and Warehouse Union (ILWU). ILWU recently helped to negotiate a pay scale through 2019 at the Fremont Transfer station that raises wages slowly between 2014 and 2019. The City of Fremont supported the pay scale increase by raising rates modestly.

ILWU and several Board members have expressed an interest in our organization taking a position in favor of higher pay, and quality affordable health care coverage for recycling workers. The draft resolution attached was prepared by StopWaste staff. It encourages member agencies and other employers of recycling workers in Alameda County to consider implementing the pay scale approved in Fremont (attached to the draft Resolution). It does not require any action of anyone, but merely encourages attention by employers and local government officials to the issue of recycling worker pay and benefits; an issue that has been in and out of the news for several years, without resolution.

It is possible that we could or should do more in the future to help address pay and benefit inequities for recycling workers. But at this time, it seems prudent to staff to just draw attention to the issue, and encourage those who set rates or hire workers to consider the specific Fremont pay schedule as a possible solution. If the Board would prefer to take a different approach, please provide staff with direction.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

That the WMA Board adopt the attached draft resolution.

Attachment: Draft Resolution

DRAFT

ALAMEDA COUNTY WASTE MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY (ACWMA)  
RESOLUTION #WMA 2014 -  
MOVED:  
SECONDED:

AT THE MEETING HELD MAY 28, 2014  
THE AUTHORITY ENCOURAGES HIGHER PAY AND HEALTH INSURANCE BENEFITS  
FOR RECYCLING WORKERS IN ALAMEDA COUNTY

**WHEREAS**, the ACWMA's vision statement seeks for the ACWMA to be a national leader in pursuing effective solutions that reduce the waste of material and other natural resources and, in doing so, accomplish other goals including creating jobs and other forms of social betterment for the residents of Alameda County; and

**WHEREAS** jobs in public sanitation traditionally have provided families with solid middle-class incomes; and

**WHEREAS** recycling workers, who do the dirty, difficult and sometimes dangerous job of processing recyclables, provide an essential public service that benefits the County's residents, businesses and visitors, and are vital to our and our member agency's efforts to minimize waste; and

**WHEREAS** recycling workers deserve a wage sufficient to support their families without public assistance, as well as affordable family health insurance; and

**WHEREAS**, the City of Fremont has shown by example that it is possible to raise wages for recycling workers with only a modest rate increase for rate payors;

**NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that the Alameda County Waste Management Authority hereby encourages its member agencies and private employers of recycling workers in Alameda County to consider implementing the pay scale approved by the City of Fremont for recycling workers ("Schedule A" from the City of Fremont, attached; note that the effective dates are January 1<sup>st</sup> of each calendar year), and actions to provide quality, affordable health insurance for these workers and their families.

**ADOPTED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:**

**AYES:**

**NOES:**

**ABSTAIN:**

**ABSENT:**

---

**Gary Wolff, Executive Director**

## SCHEDULE A

CLASSIFICATION	EFFECTIVE DATES					
	14	15	16	17	18	19
<b>Mechanic</b>	\$26.93	\$27.94	\$29.00	\$30.11	\$31.27	\$32.49
<b>Equipment Operator</b>	\$21.33	\$22.34	\$23.40	\$24.51	\$25.67	\$26.89
<b>PM Maintenance Tech</b>	\$17.83	\$18.89	\$20.02	\$21.21	\$22.48	\$23.82
<b>Scale House</b>	\$17.82	\$18.87	\$19.98	\$21.16	\$22.41	\$23.74
<b>Laborer (Site Maintenance , Spotters, Rakers)</b>	\$14.66	\$15.75	\$16.93	\$18.19	\$19.55	\$21.01
<b>Laborers trained and authorized to use the riding sweeper</b>	\$14.89	\$15.98	\$17.16	\$18.42	\$19.78	\$21.24
<b>Sorter</b>	\$14.59	\$15.68	\$16.86	\$18.12	\$19.48	\$20.94
<b>Baler Operator</b>	\$17.69	\$18.74	\$19.85	\$21.03	\$22.28	\$23.61
<b>Buyback Operator/HHW</b>	\$17.51	\$18.56	\$19.67	\$20.85	\$22.10	\$23.43
<b>Forklift Operator</b>	\$17.69	\$18.74	\$19.85	\$21.03	\$22.28	\$23.61

**Foreperson:**

A Foreperson will receive \$1.25 per hour above the highest rate working in his/her group.

**DRAFT**

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE  
ALAMEDA COUNTY WASTE MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY (WMA) BOARD  
AND  
THE ENERGY COUNCIL (EC)**

**Wednesday, May 28, 2014  
3:00 p.m.**

**StopWaste Offices  
1537 Webster Street  
Oakland, CA 94612  
510-891-6500**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

President Biddle, WMA, called to meeting to order at 3:00 p.m.

**II. ROLL CALL**

**WMA & EC**

County of Alameda	Keith Carson
City of Alameda	Lena Tam
City of Albany	Peter Maass
City of Berkeley	Kriss Worthington
Castro Valley Sanitary District	Dave Sadoff (left 4:40 p.m.)
City of Dublin	Don Biddle
City of Emeryville	Jennifer West
City of Fremont	Anu Natarajan
City of Hayward	Barbara Halliday
City of Newark	Luis Freitas (left 4:20 p.m.)
City of Oakland	Dan Kalb
Oro Loma Sanitary District	Laython Landis (left 4:10 p.m.)
City of Piedmont	Tim Rood
City of Pleasanton	Jerry Pentin (left 4:20 p.m.)
City of San Leandro	Pauline Cutter
City of Union City	Lorrin Ellis (left 4:25 p.m.)

**Absent:**

City of Livermore	Laureen Turner
-------------------	----------------

**Staff Participating:**

Gary Wolff, Executive Director  
Brian Mathews, Senior Program Manager  
Richard Taylor, Counsel, Authority Board  
Arliss Dunn, Clerk of the Board

**Others Participating:**

Bill Pollack, HHW Program Manager

**III. ANNOUNCEMENTS BY THE PRESIDENTS**

There were none.

**IV. CONSENT CALENDAR (WMA & EC)**

- 1. Approval of the Draft Joint Minutes of April 23, 2014 (WMA & EC-Separate Votes) Action**  
(Gary Wolff)
- 2. Minutes of the April 25, 2014 & May 20, 2014 Technical Advisory Group Information**  
(TAG) (EC only) (Gary Wolff)

Ms. Cutter stated she is pleased to see the shift in staff paying the full employee share of the pension cost. Ms. Cutter commended staff for implementing this measure. Ms. Halliday stated given the complexity of the agency she agrees with Ms. Strauss with respect to her comments regarding transparency in the budget of staff salaries. Mr. Wolff stated that staff will confer with the Programs and Administration committee to see how they might want to change the budget layout. Certainly it would be easy to add a single line item or note listing the sum of staff salaries. Ms. Natarajan stated the budget powerpoint presentation that is available on the website clearly lays out the details of the budget.

Ms. Natarajan made the motion to adopt the FY 14-15 budget for the WMA Board. Mr. Sadoff seconded and the motion carried 15-0 (Ellis, Freitas, Landis, Pentin, and Turner absent).

**3. FY14-15 Budget Adoption (EC only only) (Gary Wolff & Pat Cabrera)**

Staff recommends that the EC hold a public hearing, and then adopt the attached resolution, which to maximize transparency readopts the entire EC budget for FY 14-15.

Ms. Halliday motion to adopt the FY 14-15 budget for the Energy Council. Mr. Kalb seconded and the motion carried 16-0 (Ellis and Freitas absent).

**4. Amendment to Wind Easement on ACWMA Property  
(Gary Wolff & Brian Mathews) (WMA only)**

**Action**

Authorize the Executive Director to sign and implement the terms of the attached First Amendment to the Amended and Restated Easement Agreement (Attachment C).

If the Board would like to consider further negotiations with NEER with respect to price and key terms related to price, it may use the optional closed session on the agenda to have this discussion and give direction to the Executive Director as its negotiator. Such direction can also take place in open session, but then NEER will be aware of the Board's directions.

Mr. Wolff provided an overview of the staff report. The report is available here:  
<http://www.stopwaste.org/docs/05-28-14-wind.pdf>

Emre Ergas, NextEra Energy Resources, provided an overview of the proposed project and background on NextEra. Ms. Tam stated that the P&A committee was provided a detailed summary of the project and commends staff on an excellent negotiation process. Mr. Wolff recognized Brian Mathews, Senior Program Manager, for his efforts on the project. Ms. Tam made the motion to approve the staff recommendation. Mr. Carson seconded and the motion carried 14-0 (Ellis, Freitas, Landis, Pentin, Sadoff, and Turner absent).

**5. Draft Resolution on Recycling Worker Pay and Health Benefits**

That the WMA Board adopt the attached draft resolution.

Mr. Wolff provided an overview of the staff report. The report is available here:  
<http://www.stopwaste.org/docs/05-28-14-recyclingworkers.pdf>

Ms. Cutter stated support for the resolution and because it is not an ordinance cities can act appropriately. Mr. Maass stated that although workable, there will be complications with Waste Management serving several cities. Ms. West commended Fremont for taking the lead on this issue and staff for bringing the issue to the Board and inquired about the status of the Franchise Task Force and how this issue could be incorporated into that work. Ms. West added this issue aligns with the agency's mission of creating safe and well paying green jobs. Mr. Wolff added that the intent is to provide the resolution to the member agencies and other entities that we work with asking them to take a look at the issue. Ms. Halliday indicated this helps to make the case that we need to pay for recycling. Ms. Tam stated that as an agency we should make a statement of support for a prevailing wage for workers in the recycling industry.

There were 4 speakers in support of the resolution: Amy Willis, ILWU, Augustin Ramirez, ILWU, Doug Block, Teamsters, and Monica Wilson GAIA.

Ms. Tam made the motion to accept the staff recommendation. Mr. Worthington seconded and the motion carried 14-0 (Ellis, Freitas, Landis, Pentin, Sadoff, and Turner absent).

WAGE COMPARISON	ILWU 2014	TRI-CED	Difference	% Change	Total		Annual Increase 2080	ILWU 2015	% Inc.	% Hayward 60%	ILWU 2016	% Inc.	% Hayward 60%	ILWU 2017	% Inc.	% Hayward 60%	ILWU 2018	% Inc.	% Hayward 60%	ILWU 2019	% Inc.	% Hayward 60%	
					Employees	% Hayward 60%																	
Baler Operator	17.69	15.18	2.51	17%	3	4.518	9397.44	18.74	5.9%	\$ 334.67	19.85	5.9%	\$ 345.87	21.03	5.9%	\$ 356.76	22.28	5.9%	\$ 369.39	23.61	5.9%	\$ 382.47	
Sorter	14.59	13.65	0.94	7%	11	6.204	12904.32	15.68	7.5%	\$ 578.44	16.86	7.5%	\$ 608.79	18.12	7.5%	\$ 634.12	19.48	7.5%	\$ 662.65	20.94	7.5%	\$ 692.47	
Forklift Operator	17.69	15.78	1.91	12%	3	3.438	7151.04	18.74	5.9%	\$ 254.67	19.85	5.9%	\$ 263.19	21.03	5.9%	\$ 271.48	22.28	5.9%	\$ 281.09	23.61	5.9%	\$ 291.04	
Mechanics (Senior)	26.93	33.94	-7.01	-21%	1																		
Mechanic	26.93	29.94	-3.01	-10%	1																		
Equipment Operator (Loader)	21.33	17.33	4.1	24%	1	2.46	5116.8	22.34	4.7%	\$ 145.37	23.4	4.7%	\$ 149.81	24.51	4.7%	\$ 152.62	25.67	4.7%	\$ 156.92	26.89	4.7%	\$ 161.35	
Total Wage Adjustment to bring IPC workers in conformance with ILWU wage schedules							\$ 34,569.60			\$ 1,313.16			\$ 1,367.66			\$ 1,414.98			\$ 1,470.06			\$ 1,527.33	
Hayward household monthly increase (combined)							45112	\$ 0.06		\$ 0.002			\$ 0.003			\$ 0.003			\$ 0.003			\$ 0.003	
Union City household monthly increase (combined)							19707	\$ 23,046.40	\$ 0.10														

Narrative:

- 1 The ILWU recommended and proposed wage rates for each selected category can be found in Column B (yellow)
- 2 The current Tri-CED employee wage rates can be found in Column C (blue)
- 3 Column D shows the difference between the ILWU rates and the Tri-CED rates
- 4 Column E shows the % change in those differences
- 5 Column F shows the current Tri-CED employees in each selected job category
- 6 Column G shows the allocated % for those categories for the Hayward contract
- 7 Column H shows the annualized (2080 hours) costs for the total employees in each category to achieve the proposed ILWU rates
- 8 Line 15 shows the total costs required from the City of Hayward in each year (i.e., 2014 and so forth up to 2019) in order to bring the current Tri-CED rates into conformance with the ILWU rates
- 9 Line 18 shows the amount of monthly increase for each household, based upon 45,112 households, that would be required in each year to achieve these rate adjustment objectives.